

Agenda Item 6

SHEFFIELD CONSERVATION ADVISORY GROUP

Meeting held 21st May, 2013

PRESENT:	<u>Name</u>	<u>Organisation</u>
	Mr. Tim Hale (Deputy Chair)	Sheffield Chamber of Commerce
	Prof. Clyde Binfield	20th Century Society
	Mr. Patrick Burns	Co-opted Member
	Mr. Howard Greaves	Hallamshire Historic Buildings Society
	Mr. Graham Hague	Victorian Society
	Dr. Roger Harper	Ancient Monuments Society
	Mr. Stanley Jones	Hunter Archaeological Society
	Mr. Bob Marshall	Royal Town Planning Institute
	Mr. Philip Moore	Sheffield Society of Architects
	Dr. Malcolm Tait	University of Sheffield

.....

1. **APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

Apologies for absence were received from Dr. Philip Booth (Co-opted Member).

2. **MINUTES,**

The minutes of the meeting held on 19th March, 2013 were approved as a correct record, subject to (a) the deletion in the attendance, of the words "Mr. Graham Hague (Victorian Society)" and (b) the substitution (i) in item 5 (b)(i) of the words "Low Matlock Waterwheel" for the words "Lower Matlock Waterwheel", (ii) in item 8 of the words " on the condition of" for the words "on condition of" and (iii) in item 8(b) of the words "if it was lost" for the words "if it was lost; and";

and, arising therefrom, the Group noted (a) a written response from the Director of Planning to a letter from the Chair (Dr. Philip Booth), on behalf of the Group, regarding the development of Barnes Hall Farm and (b) that:-

- (i) the Haqqani House Mosque had been demolished because it had become structurally unsound. The Head of Planning would report on the relevant legislation, which was flawed to the extent that no action could be taken to punish any wrongdoing in the case. As a result of the loss of the building, it was likely that a further triangular site would be lost ;
- (ii) the developer was in the process of discharging conditions at the Crookes Valley Methodist Church, Barber Road. It was anticipated that new plans would be submitted regarding the floor levels, as the contractors had hit rock;
- (iii) listing had not been granted in respect of (A) Knowle Hill Mill, Station Road,

Mosborough and (B) Cow Mouth Farm;
(iv) it was considered that the Moor View Farm, which was part of the Crosspool Manor scheme, was of listable quality; and
(v) the Head of Planning would (A) hold a meeting in the near future with the owners of Loxley Old Chapel and would consider serving, if appropriate, an urgent works notice regarding the property and (B) consider taking similar action regarding a barn at Onesacre.

3. **CHAIR'S REPORT**

The Deputy Chair reported, on behalf of the Chair (Dr. Philip Booth), that:-
(a) it was anticipated that application would be made for judicial review and an injunction regarding the former Jessop's Hospital's Edwardian Wing;
(b) overall, the refurbishment of the Sellars Wheel had been carried out to a good Standard;
(c) a recent legal case regarding the siting of a wind farm close to a National Trust property had established that "special regard" must be given to the desirability of preserving the setting of a heritage asset and planning permission for the development had been revoked.

The Group (i) noted the information and (ii) agreed that a visit of inspection should be made each year, to a suitable heritage asset within the City, following its re-development.

4. **HEAD OF PLANNING'S REPORT**

The Head of Planning reported that (a) public consultations regarding the draft City Centre Masterplan would end on 30th June next. The Plan proposed the installation of additional track for the Supertram. A report would be made to the next meeting on the implications of the Plan for the conservation areas and heritage assets which could be affected.

The Group noted the information.

5. **SHEFFIELD SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT AND DESIGN PANEL**

The Group noted that the scheduled meeting of the Sheffield Sustainable Development and Design Panel in May 2013 had been cancelled and its next meeting would be held on 27th June, 2013.

6. **HERITAGE ASSETS**

The Group considered the following applications for planning permission for development affecting Heritage Assets and made the observations stated:-

- (a) Erection of 4 detached dwellinghouses (Resubmission of withdrawn planning application 12/01095/OUT) on land at rear of 315 to 329 Baslow Road (Case Number: **13/01273/OUT**)

The Group felt that there was no objection, in principle, to the outline development, although considerable detail regarding the application was still required.

- (b) Phase 1 - Full application - alterations to existing buildings for use as

educational facility (Class D1) and for Classes B1 (Business), A1 (Shops), A3 (Restaurants and Cafes), A4 (Drinking Establishments), D1 (Non-residential Institutions) and D2 (Assembly and Leisure) purposes including ancillary student common room areas and associated plant and storage space and erection of an 18 storey high building to provide 51 student cluster flats with ancillary accommodation and a commercial unit for Class A1 (Shops), A3 (Restaurants and Cafes) and A4 (Drinking Establishments) purposes at the former Head Post Office, Fitzalan Square (Case Number: **13/00770/FUL & 13/00771/LBC**)

The Group felt that the height of the development was unacceptable, the design made no acknowledgment of the colour, scale, form and materials of the heritage assets and the huge tower looked incongruous and would severely damage the setting of the nearby heritage assets and the streetscape. The Group considered that, in view of the planning permission which had been granted, a nine storey building could be acceptable, but the present scheme had no character and its impact on the area and the listed buildings was totally unacceptable. The Group felt that the site was very prominent, poor justification for its use had been made and a full development appraisal of the site should be made. The Group affirmed its previous decision regarding the development and observed that the development of what was a public building, would have no public benefit unless it was also open to the public in some way.

- (c) Erection of 3 dwellinghouses, laying out of driveway and associated parking and landscaping on land adjacent to driveway to Tapton Park Gardens, Tapton Park Road, (Case Number: **13/01458/FUL**)

The Group felt that the design was fussy and inappropriate and it bore no relation to the design of the adjacent houses. The Group considered that a reduced scheme with amended design could be acceptable, but the loss of mature trees was unacceptable and the development would have a damaging impact on the conservation area. The Group welcomed the proposed use of natural materials.

- (d) (NOTE) an application for the demolition of existing outbuildings and the erection of a two storey building, containing 4 self contained 1 bedroom units, at Abbeyfield House, 24 Broomhall Road (Case Number: **13/01398/FUL**) was withdrawn from consideration.

7. MISCELLANEOUS ITEMS

Members of the Group reported on developments affecting Heritage Assets and Conservation Areas and the Group noted that:-

- (a) In the opinion of Mr. Jones, the Old Hall, Brightholmlee deserved to be listed at Grade II*;
- (b) a number of buildings within the City had been demolished which, in the opinion of Mr. Hague, had been significant buildings, although they had

not been listed, including the Southview Methodist Church, Saint John's Church, Sharrow Lane, the Knowle Hill Corn Mill, Mosborough, the National School attached to Holy Trinity Church, Nursery Street, part of Butler's Terrace and the Traveller's Inn, Penistone Road. Accordingly it was essential to be vigilant and to draw attention to the potential loss of further important buildings;

- (c) the Fairfield Inn, Neepsend was in poor condition;
- (d) the Brincliffe Oaks Public House, which had been largely demolished, would be rebuilt;
- (e) the Head of Planning would (i) investigate and report back on the installation of new fenestration at the nursery adjoining the Francis Newton Public House, Clarkehouse Road and the possibility that Old May House Farm, Mayfield Valley, was listed or of listable quality and (ii) keep a watching brief on the former Sawmill, Wicker which was still in a parlous state;
- (f) In the opinion of Mr. Moore, a planning application regarding Mylnhurst School which had been submitted, was worthy of close attention;
- (g) a planning application had been submitted for the conversion, to flats, of the upper floors of the Loch Fyne Restaurant, Glossop Road;
- (h) the grounds at the rear of Abbeydale Hall, which were of wildlife importance, were being dug up pursuant to a planning consent which had been granted on appeal;

(NOTE: The above minutes are subject to amendment at a future meeting)